

SUMMARY OF KEY FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS AND KEY ACTIONS FROM THE ASSESSMENT STUDY TO IDENTIFY INSTITUTIONAL, LEGAL AND FINANCIAL BOTTLENECKS ON POVERTY-ENVIRONMENT IMPLEMENTATION AT DIFFERENT LEVELS OF DISTRICT, WARD AND VILLAGE IN BUKOBA RURAL , BUNDA, IKUNGI, ILEJE, NYASA, AND SENGEREMA DISTRICTS

Dr. Gratian R. Bamwenda, Hamza Mkai, Margareth Nzuki, and Abdallah. K. Hassan

Economic and Social Research Foundation, 51 Uporoto Street, Ursino Estate, P.O .Box 31226
Da es Salaam, Tanzania

Key themes: Identifying institutional, legal, and budgetary process bottlenecks and challenges that hinder translation of P-E related initiatives/outputs into impacts at district level; Recommendations on improving the performance of implementation of Poverty-Environment Initiatives in six pilot districts of Tanzania, i.e., Bukoba Rural, Bunda, Ikungi, Ileje, Nyasa and Sengerema

INTRODUCTION

Tanzania with a population of 44.9 million people and with population growth rate of 2.9% (URT, 2012) and most of the citizens depend on natural resources for income and livelihood. Tanzania is endowed with regenerative natural resources and non-regenerative natural resources including minerals, gold, diamond, iron, coal, nickel, Tanzanite, uranium and natural gas. The richness in natural resources constitutes a major asset and opportunity, which is fundamental for growth and economic development, including poverty reduction. Nonetheless, Tanzania stands as one of the world's poorest countries (URT, 2013; World Bank 2014). Among the regions with the highest levels of poverty are: Dodoma, Kagera, Kigoma, Lindi, Manyara, Mara, Mbeya, Mtwara, Mwanza, Rukwa, Shinyanga, Singida, and Tabora (NBS 2012). According to the 2011/12 Household Budget Survey (HBS), 28.9% of the population is living below basic needs poverty line and that 9.7% are living below food poverty line.

To address the above challenges, the Government and other partners are designing and implementing initiatives to address the above challenges, including mainstreaming poverty-environment and gender linkages into national development and sub-national development planning. One of these initiatives is the Poverty-Environment Initiative (PEI), which is supported by the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) and the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP). The PEI, which was launched in 2003/4, assists the government decision-makers and a wide range of other stakeholders to manage the environment and improve poverty and gender issues in a way that improves livelihoods and sustainable economic growth. Six Districts, i.e. Bukoba Rural, Bunda, Ikungi, Ileje, , Nyasa and Sengerema have been chosen as a pilot part of this initiative to identify and document challenges and development results that can be scaled-up in line with national and sectoral policies.

Objectives

The main objective of this study was to identify institutional, legal, financial bottlenecks on Poverty-Environment (including related CC and gender equality issues) implementation at different administrative levels of Bunda, Bukoba Rural, Nyasa, Ileje, Ikungi and Sengerema Districts, wards and villages. The specific objectives were: i) To assess institutional, organizational and legal capacities as well as coordination mechanisms to help implement P-E objectives that are mainstreamed into DDPs; ii) To assess main budgetary process bottlenecks and challenges that hinder translation of P-E related objectives into impacts at district level; iii) To propose the interventions or recommendations (institutional, legal and budgetary) to remove bottlenecks and challenges.

Approach used

The assessment was conducted in a consultative and participatory approach, using questionnaires, focus group discussions, and interviews with District Council authorities and meeting with stakeholders involved in poverty, environment, and gender issues in the six districts. Ideas for future progress were discussed and agreed (where possible) with those most closely involved in Poverty-Environment-Gender -Climate Change (PEG-CC) initiatives and related activities implementation.

KEY FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This summary of findings and recommendations should be read in conjunction with the contents of the Main Report. The aim of this section is to put together a summary of key findings and recommendations that have to be carried out by various parties.

INSTITUTIONAL ISSUES

The legal basis on local government *position*, institutional framework, *and structure* is enshrined in the Constitution of the United Republic 1977, Articles 145 and 146, and in the Local Government's related main legislation: Government (Urban Authorities) Act 1982; Local Government Finance Act 1982; Urban Authorities (Rating) Act 1983; Regional Administration Act 1997; and Local Government Laws (Miscellaneous Amendments) Act 1999.

Currently, there are reviews and reforms being carried out under the Local Government Reform Program (LGRP) to align the local governments' operations with current free market realities and business environment. Those being considered for review are e.g. finance act CAP 290 (Act Na.9 of 1982) to provide for enhanced improved financial management. In addition, the following regulations have been earmarked for review: the Local Government Acts (Rural Na 7 CAP 287), Urban Act No 8, 288) both 1982 and Regional Administration Act No 19, of 1997.

Key findings

Although the most functions have been assigned to the District Council, this study found that some of the services and infrastructure (e.g. civil works, water, roads, and power) are still being provided by the Central Government or its executive agencies. Also, most of the funding to support them still comes from the Central Government.

The respondents in most Districts reported that the institutional framework is satisfactorily supportive and enables implementation of P-E-G objectives at district level including wards and village level. The institutional and administrative challenges that were reported include:

- Insufficient knowledge, skills and inadequate coping mechanisms by the Councilors and some technical staff in District Councils to the ongoing quantities and fast pace of reforms and social, legal, and economic changes at national and global levels, which is causing overload, confusion, adaptation burden, and resistance to change.
- Lack of qualified professional staff in some subject areas, such Livestock, Crop Production, Fisheries, Environmental Management, Natural Resources Management, Research and Statistics Management, Risk Management, and Monitoring and Evaluation.
- Lack of long term Regional Development Plan and Village Land Use Plans is hindering proper planning for the future P-E-G activities in the Districts. In addition, this is sometimes causing unplanned development human settlements, and sometimes friction between farmers and agro-pastoralists.
- Low administrative and organizational capacity from District Council to the Village Councils and inadequate expertise among Councilors- overseeing several sectors (e.g. Committee on Economic, Infrastructure, and Environment, or the Committee on Education, Health, and Water). The respondents recommended that the composition of the Committees should look like that of Parliamentary Committees.
- Lack of working tools and facilities affecting good governance and sometimes compromising accountability in service delivery, e.g. in some remote areas the office of the Village Executive Officers are in their homes.

Recommendations

The Central Government, LGA, business community, and development partners should further strengthen and enhance capabilities of enterprises, community and business associations, and public sector to effectively and efficiently mainstream these issues in the local development agenda/framework and implement them in line with community wants and needs to enhance ownership and long term sustainability. The key required capabilities are: Governance capital; Knowledge, skills, and technology capital; and Resources capital- including information, financial, and infrastructural resources). In addition, there is a need review the devolving the

powers from central government to local government (Opportunities and Obstacles for Development- O & OD) approach to evaluate its viability and performance to date from national to District and village levels, and to identify gaps and develop a strategy/remedial measures how to further improve the mainstreaming and implementation of PEG-CC objectives into District Development Plans.

The Central Government, LGA, business community, and development partners should further strengthen and enhance capabilities of enterprises, community and business associations, and the public sector to effectively and efficiently mainstream PEG-CC issues in the local development agenda/framework and implement them in line with community wants and needs to enhance ownership and long term sustainability. The required key capabilities are: Governance capital; Knowledge, skills, and technology capital; and Resources capital- including information, financial, and infrastructural resources). In addition, there is a need review the devolving the powers from central government to local government (Opportunities and Obstacles for Development- O & OD) approach to evaluate its viability and performance to date from national to District and village levels, and to identify gaps and develop a strategy/remedial measures how to further improve the mainstreaming and implementation of PEG-CC objectives into District Development Plans.

Key actions

*General actions*¹

- i. The Central Government should improve the administrative and organizational capacity by allowing the District Council to recruit, adequately compensate and build the skills of a number of highly sought technical staff and avail incentives that will stem the potential leakage of existing trained, skilled staff to other better paying institutions/jobs. Currently the recruitment is done through the Public Service Recruitment Secretariat (PSRS) in Dar es Salaam. In addition, the District Council should liaise and request the President's Office Public Service Management PO-PSM and PSRS to issue permit to recruit key technical cadres.

*Specific actions*²

¹ Interventions that need change of national constitution, policy, legislation or the commitment of the Central Government or other national/regional entities

² Specific Interventions that can be implemented within District Council's jurisdiction and means.

- ii. The District Council should formulate a long-term vision and develop a strategic plan that will give direction and drive P-E interventions, and social economic development and growth in the District. This includes identification of District's current status and needs, forward thinking on the District's future and how it should head there, and devising strategies and activities for addressing challenges, priorities, barriers, risks, and resources requirements for disseminating, budgeting and mainstreaming realistic activities in the action plan/ MTEF, implementing, and monitoring and evaluating progress of the strategic plan.
- iii. Enhance the capacity among the Bunda, Ikungi, Ileje, Sengerema, Nyasa and Bukoba Rural District Councils to dialogue among themselves and PEI stakeholders to communicate, network and exchange knowledge and ideas. This can be done, for example, by establishing an accessible ICT knowledge -based platform that would enable the above six District Councils to generate, share, and exchange data, information (in Kiswahili), knowledge, innovative ideas, and valuable approaches arising from Poverty-Environment initiatives. Such an initiative would enable the formation of long-lasting linkages and alliances at community, individual and government-private/entrepreneurial sector levels. In addition, robust linkage mechanisms may: drive innovations; enhance collaborative design and implementation of projects; and enhance resources and know how transfer and uptake of technologies and best practices for productive processes. Subsequently, this may increase inter-district human, commercial and trade relations, and contribute to social economic change at household, community, and District levels. This intervention is proposed because in this study it was found that there was lack or limited communication and linkages not only between Districts but even between wards, even within a radius of three hundred kilometers.
- iv. The District Council should increase efforts in engaging the Diaspora so that it can invest in enhancements that can contribute to P-E initiatives and ensure sustainability after the end of the PEI project. The District council management team and the business community should document, compile, and distribute the District's potentials, opportunities, social economic profile, and investment profile. In addition, the District council should encourage the Diaspora to invest in long-term, high impact activities such as capital/financing, natural resources-based enterprise development and growth (e.g. quality edible oils and related products, oleochemicals, biodiesel production and blending, post harvest management facilities), secondary value addition (e.g. milling,

processing, packaging, by-products and waste streams/residues recycling and re-use), human settlements development, manufacturing, social services (e.g. to education, health and water infrastructure), and physical infrastructural facilities (sanitation facilities, roads, railways, energy, air and water transport). Other potential investment areas in the Districts include: i) business advisory services and tertiary training; ii) development of value and supply chains; and iii) delivery/deployment of customized technologies, machines, equipment, and other labour-saving implements (e.g. efficient biomass conversion, development of forest products based industries, apiary and inland aquaculture industries, alternative power generation, water extraction and distributions for household use and for irrigation in precision agriculture, etc).

- v. The District Council should develop beneficial strategic alliances with national, regional, and international institutions and organizations dealing with capacity and capabilities building, development, and research. This would facilitate a fast responsiveness to emerging problems, reduce lead times from design to project completion, and provide of continuous support after the P-E projects end (e.g. monitoring and evaluation, analysis of overall performance of P-E interventions at Ward and Village levels, review of outcomes to impact assessment and readjustment, provision of technical services for knowhow and technologies adaption, adoption, and intellectual property management, etc).
- vi. The District's business community should establish a District Business Council that will: create a respected leadership on the district's business and economic sustainability; provide a forum for its members, who represent all business sectors, to share best practices on business and District's sustainable development issues; advocate for progress and delivering results by developing innovative tools that will address emerging opportunities and socio-economic constraints affecting business development and for catalyzing change the status quo; play the leading advocacy role for business development of respective industries; drive debate and policy change in favor of sustainable enterprise (from small to large enterprises) and development solutions; foster competitiveness of the District's productive processes and sectors and value and supply chains; and leverage strong relationships and collaborative arrangements with stakeholders, including the District Council, Central Government, and regional and international institutions and organizations.
- vii. Establish and implement an independent District Advisory Committee composed of highly skilled and experienced experts from various fields to advice and provide technical assistance to the District Council's management team and Full Council on: i) forward-thinking, good governance and effective accountability; ii) economic assessment, financial analysis, design, planning, strategic investment, and execution of projects, specifically physical and technical infrastructure and energy projects such as mini grids,

wind and solar power development and utilization; iii) access, acquisition and use of proprietary technologies for education, health, agriculture, livestock, fisheries, natural resources (e.g. investment in tourism, reforestation and plantations for timber and charcoal production), and manufacturing sectors' development; iii) mobilization, allocation, and modern management of financial resources; iv) translation of national and international policies, strategies and initiatives into District realities; v) legal advice and negotiations, and vi) development of value and supply chains for products and services generated in the District.

- viii. The District Council should train technical staff on results-based management and budgeting systems for better planning and implementation of PEG interventions and public governance performance to enable establishment of results-based management and results-based budgeting systems;
- ix. The District Executive Directors in collaboration with NGOs should recruit a trainer or a consultant to help them to develop a sustainable financing strategy and expose the District authorities to other funding mechanisms such as from local banks for PEG-CC investments by business enterprises, or private sector-LGA/community partnership (such as TIB, Twiga Bank, NMB, CRDB, Agricultural Bank, etc.); community and private sector development framework programs; multilateral bodies and bilateral donors; and private foundations and philanthropic organizations. A typical example is that the LGAs or communities could use resources from the Clean Development Mechanism (CDM) for implementation of Environmental and Climate Change interventions in the afforestation area or for rural electrification projects using solar panels, biogas for lighting, or for the installation of more energy efficient household and institutional stoves, or for installing eco-efficient industrial boilers/heating entities in processing SMEs. The CDM allows a community/country to implement an emission-reduction projects that earn saleable certified emission reduction (CER) credits, each equivalent to one ton of carbon dioxide, which can be counted towards meeting Kyoto targets.
- x. To increase the level of governance and accountability and improve the understanding between policy makers and implementers, the District Council in collaboration with NGOs should train the policy makers and technical staff on good governance and Open Government Initiative and their application in implementing PEG-CC. The District Council should play a leading role in soliciting financial and material resources to implement this proposal.
- xi. The District Council should design, install, and effectively use an Information Management System (IMS) and facilitate its use by other stakeholders to facilitate the linkage, access, and smooth flow of information between PEG-CC actors. The IMS may also improve the information absorption capacity; facilitate the documentation, storage and sharing of knowhow; and aid learning from others and past experiences from local

and international sources. Furthermore, the IMS may assist planning, implementation, monitoring, and assessment of the PEG-CC, education, and health agenda.

- xii. The District Council in collaboration with the Prime Minister’s Office – Regional Administration and Local Government (PMO-RALG), Tanzania Investment Center, Export Processing Zones Authority (*EPZA*), Ministry of Industries Trade and Marketing, and agriculture lead ministries to develop and promote a District investment profile and allocate land for the development of crop and livestock products value chains, and establishment of an industrial park and human settlements. In addition, the District Council should strategize on how to provide basic infrastructure such as, water, electricity, ICT, sewerage facilities, roads, and waste management recycling and disposal facilities.
- xiii. Promote Public-Private Partnership (PPP) for covering immediate and medium term gaps in the district budget, while waiting the flow of funds from the Central Government. This can be achieved through establishing joint investments (e.g. in medium to large scale agriculture, livestock, and forestry projects, value adding/processing industries, human settlements, and physical infrastructure projects. Another way is to organize frequent PPP and investment promotion forums at different levels – District, Ward, Divisional and Village levels or to visit and make the case among regional and prospective international investors.

Legal issues

The PMO-RALG and the Attorney General should undertake a coordinated review of the LGA related legislation and regulations to facilitate and create an enabling environment for an integrated, collaborative multi-sectoral PEG-CC interventions and multi-stakeholder investments that will self-start additional development initiatives at District level and catalyze the required transformation using resources currently available to them.

Key actions

General actions

- i. Form a task force (with members from various stakeholders) with terms of reference to identify gaps in the current legislation, and regulations of Local Government acts and Regional Administration Act in relation to the need for the improved revenue administration and regulation, PPP policy requirements, and other requirements from the communities, private sector and civil society. The Task Force will have to propose an action plan on

dealing with these issues, i.e. what is the issue, what needs to be done, responsible ministry/institutions, long term or short term period, and recommendation for funding, etc.

- ii. Review the Government (Urban Authorities) Act 1982; Local Government Finance Act 1982; Urban Authorities (Rating) Act 1983; Regional Administration Act 1997; Local Government Laws (Miscellaneous Amendments) Act 1999, Environmental Management Act, 2004, Forest Act (2002), and Procurement Act, 2004, to: align them with current free market realities and business environment; to increase the autonomy of the Council in the revenue collection, mobilization, allocation and use of internal sources; to facilitate increased PPP collaboration for generation of new and additional finance and investments in innovative, high impact PEG-CC and other development initiatives and projects; recruit and retain skilled, experienced, knowledgeable, professional technical cadre; and to remove conflicts between old sectoral laws and by-laws.
- iii. Revise the constitution and electoral legislation to raise the level of education of District Councilors to a minimum of High School to enable the Councilors to cope with the pace of fast changing and complexities of modern governance, business management, short life cycle technological solutions, and modern market based regulatory instruments and processes. This, together with continuous training will enhance the foresighting capabilities; enable them to recognize and take advantage of emerging opportunities, and effectively to address PEG-CC challenges. Putting in place and raising the education requirement to current realities will also enable the elected councilors to create a more transparent and enabling environment for the implementation of PEG-CC activities.
- iv. The Central Government in collaboration with Council to strengthen governance in land distribution particularly the Ward Land Tribunals (WLTs) to avoid land disputes and increase public awareness on land laws. Currently most of the WLTs (Land disputes Courts Act of 2002) lack training related to land dispute management.
- v. Develop and deliver training modules to the Council staff and Chairpersons, executive secretaries of wards and villages, on formulating and affective implementation of by-laws and regulations and sectoral legislation related to PEG-CC issues.

Budgetary issues

The Council should undertake an assessment of the full range of natural resources available in their area and carefully leverage revenue from natural resource exploitation or extraction (including negotiating and getting appropriate allocation/taxes from the natural resources under the Central government domain) to implement PEG-CC interventions for broad based local socio-economic growth. In addition, the District Council should support entrepreneurs and facilitate and encourage businesses to invest more and diversify into other innovative high value areas; to develop, grow and cope with competitive forces so as to subsequently enable the District Council to broaden its tax base.

Key actions

General actions

- i. The Central government and District Council leadership should foster the development of human and institutional capacity at the District Council and among contracted tax collection agents to ensure the District Council collects adequate taxes and cess charges and to minimize tax evasion.
- ii. The Central government should reform the current cess rates, which are currently based on gross value of production, that are resulting in very high tax on net revenue among farmers, and pastoralists, and natural resources products' producers that use a large amount of inputs but experience small net margins. This is resulting in frustration regression, making value chain participants to change their production and marketing behavior to lower their cess payments, and even to resort to tax evasion/avoidance as a coping strategy. The reform may include strengthening collection capacity and methods (e.g. using ICT based instruments, collecting cess after the sale, etc), reducing the rates to broaden the base, to institute a differential cess for food, cash and export products, etc.

Specific actions

- iii. The Council to establish a Development Fund to adequately fund development and PEG-CC related activities. The Council should sensitize citizens, development agents, and business community to contribute to the proposed fund. This has to be supplemented by the Central Government by allocating and disbursing sufficient financial, human, and technical resources for development and recurrent expenditure to the Council.
- iv. The District Council, communities and individuals should partner with businesses and producer cooperatives, National Private Sector Service Providers/Technical Services Providers, and Business Associations, (e.g. TSPF, ACT, RCT, TCIIA, CTI, etc) to ensure the availability of capital goods and technology transfers that enhance productivity and efficiency;
- v. The District council should strengthen the transparency, honesty, and accountability on revenue management (allocation, expenditure, and reporting) and tackle corruption to increase citizens' support.
- vi. The District Council in collaboration with Central Government and/or development agents should play a proactive role to train and re-train Councilors and Council's technical staff to enhance the understanding of emerging technical, business, regulatory, trade, green growth and sustainable development issues;

- vii. The District Council in collaboration with development partners to identify and address reasons for reluctance of financial services and banks to lend for Ward and Village level PEG-CC, agricultural, livestock, and forestry development investments in a given District; and
- viii. Facilitate entrepreneurs' and women groups' access to savings and credit facilities (Savings and Credit Cooperatives Societies- SACCOS, Rotating Savings and Credit Associations- ROSCAS, and VICOBA). To begin with, undertake advocacy on saving and lending options, and train women's producer associations, cooperatives and groups to enhance their administration capacity, organizational and financial management skills, options for reducing cost of delivering financial services and recovery of bad debts, diversification of loan portfolios, risk management, telephone banking, etc., and support capacity-building in the creation and formalization of related financial self-help networks at the village, ward and District levels.

The Central Government and the District Council should allocate resources for the above activities.

6.2.2 Coordination

Improve and consolidate coordination efforts by creating respective joint public sector-private sector-community-associations-civil society committees to oversee the design, planning and implementation of PEG-CC initiatives.

Key actions

General actions

- i. The Central Government and District Council should clearly articulate the roles and responsibilities of different ministries, public institutions and agencies, and private institutions, with a mandate on PEG issues;
- ii. PMO-RALG is mandated over Local Government Authorities and therefore better placed to coordinate stakeholder efforts geared to address the PEG-CC challenges. To address coordination challenges, it might be necessary to establish a *National Coordinating Committee* to oversee the implementation of PEG-CC and other development issues at local level. The coordinating committee will have scheduled meeting sessions and forums for collaborative planning, coordinating finance mobilization and allocation, follow up, monitoring and evaluation, readjustment, reporting, and implementation of

the deliberations to be developed during the stakeholders meetings. This will enable better cooperation between the District Council, PEG-CC stakeholder, and funders and will minimize overlaps and unnecessary competition for resources and attribution. The coordinating committee may propose studies to reengineer the LGA system, to draw lessons on local government reforms from other countries, and devise and plans on reinforcing performance at LGA level;

- iii. Ensure that the institutions and organizations supporting national level PEG-CC policies and strategies get a coordinated direction from an established coordinating entity in the PMO RALG. In addition, this entity should work in close collaboration/communication with the other stakeholders for multi-sectoral involvement using collaborative joined-up approaches in implementation of the PEG-CC activities, with particular emphasis on creating conditions conducive to the participation of the private sector and non-state actors. Lastly, the coordination entity should develop and strengthen district, regional, sectoral and cross-sectoral institutional and regulatory co-ordination for harmonization of conceptualization, planning, administration/management, execution, monitoring and evaluation, and reporting of P-E interventions;
- iv. The Central Government, District Council, and PEG agents should establish a committee (e.g. The District PEG-CC Interventions Committee) at District level to oversee the funding, execution, monitoring and evaluation, and reporting processes on P-E-G, climate change, and gender mainstreaming issues conducted by public and private entities, CBOs, NGOs, etc, rather than having several entities doing the same or their own things according to their own interests. In addition, there is a need to pursue ways of ensuring greater coordination and synergies among all parties engaged in the P-E-G, and climate change mitigation and adaptation portfolio, including synergies for M&E of the portfolio, e.g. through regular planning and evaluation meetings in order to have a more active role in portfolio oversight through (at least) semi-annual meetings at which key M&E progress reports are presented by the participants and discussed by the Committee. The committee should also ensure regular communications among Government departments, Agencies, and other Non State Actors to keep partners abreast of activities in the portfolio, and share results and lessons and to be up to date for future portfolio strategic planning.

AGRICULTURE, LIVESTOCK AND NATURAL RESOURCES ISSUES

Key findings

The focus group discussions and interviews with farmers and pastoralists revealed that agricultural, livestock, and natural resources sectors at District level are facing several key bottlenecks including: use of poor genetic potential of crop varieties animal breeds; limited access to affordable finance; limited use of modern agricultural technologies and inputs, especially improved seed varieties, fertilizers, agrochemicals and mechanization; high crop losses due to pest and disease and poor post-harvest management. Other include unsustainable exploitation of natural resources; low capacity of farmer groups and cooperatives to engage in value addition, marketing activities and participation in valuable value chains.

Recommendations

Enhance the vibrancy of the agricultural, livestock and natural resources sectors by enhancing producer empowerment and market linkages through developing respective functional supply and value chains and encouraging the stakeholders to participate. In addition, the Central and local government should strengthen the regulatory framework to reduce illegal practices and control overexploitation.

Key actions

Specific actions

- i. The District Council, private sector, and other development partners to avail affordable irrigation facilities and equipment (especially alternative energy based water pumping and holding/storage systems e.g. solar or wind or efficient petrol power pumping systems), quality and safe agro-chemicals, alternative pest control methods, efficient irrigation practices and maintenance, intensification/precision agriculture know how, and quality packaging to horticultural farmers in Bukoba Rural, Bunda, Sengerema, Ileje and Nyasa districts. These Districts are producing and may substantially expand the volumes and are close to local, regional and cross border markets with high demand for produce, and fast growing populations with increasing disposable income, e.g. Mwanza, Musoma, Nyasa town, Mbinga, Ruvuma, Singida, Bukoba, Misenyi, Mutukula, Tunduma, Mbeya, and tourism centers such as Serengeti, Saa Nane, and emerging ecotourism centers in Kagera. For instance, in Serengeti ward, Bunda, several horticultural farmers reported earning between US\$ 700 and 1200 per month from selling the produce to nearby towns and Serengeti tourism centers (note that this income is about two to three times the average annual national income; e.g. according to 2012 estimates, the national average per capita income was TShs 995,931 (about US\$ 628.9) per year). Lessons may be learned from Jipe Moyo Group in Bunda District.

- ii. Promote oil seeds production, milling and oil refining technologies to improve quality and shelf life and increased income for individuals and communities.
- iii. Conduct a health check on horticultural and vegetable oil production and develop tools and train women and groups to be responsive to market and consumer needs, in particular quality and safety issues.
- iv. The District Council should give incentives and create an enabling environment for the private sector to invest and participate in a wide range of agricultural business opportunities (stable policies, favorable and consistent legal and regulatory framework, fair taxation, even playing field for competition, tax breaks, concessions, allowing business entities to participate in District planning, getting upfront information on future direction to be set by the District authorities, etc), that is to invest in inputs shops and advice centers (on researched technologies and professional private technical and extension services) at Ward and village levels to enhance the availability of improved seeds and varieties of plants, livestock and tree seeds to respond to different and changing needs of farmers and consumers and consistent with local specificities. A leaf could be borrowed from soda, beer and eco-centers business models.
- v. Districts, wards, and Villages should be encouraged and facilitated by the District Council experts and consultants to develop investment profiles, strategic plans, and strategies to translate national, regional and international initiatives, strategies, and plans into local level implementable plans and activities. A typical case here is the National Climate Change Strategy, 2013 and National Adaptation Plan (NAPA). Lessons could be learned from Millennium Villages (e.g. in Uyui, Tabora), Humboro Village in Dodoma, and Smart Villages Initiative.
- vi. The District Councils should encourage citizens to diversify and invest in non-farm activities such as the development of forests to generate wood and non-wood forest products (NWFPs) such as bee products³, gums, natural dyes, fruit and nuts, fiber, spices, bamboo, raffia and some medicinal plants. Lessons could be learned in South Africa, DRC Congo, Malaysia, Thailand and Vietnam.

³ Tanzania is capable of supporting up to more than 9 million productive bee colonies. Only 3.5 percent of the production potentials of bee products are tapped. The estimated potential of bee products is about 138,000 tons of honey and 9,200 tons of beeswax per annum. Currently, only 9,380 tons of honey worth US\$ 9.38 million and about 324 tons of beeswax worth US\$ 1.875 million are produced annually. Beekeeping also employs about 2 million people in the rural areas (Natural Resources Sector Review, MNRT, October 2014)

- vii. Strengthen the capacity to oversee protection of forests reserves including forest boundary consolidation; eviction from forest reserves; expansion of new plantations; continually improving harvesting guidelines; promoting and signing Joint Forest Management Agreements and Community Based Forest Management with more villages; closely following up the monitoring, licensing, registration and transportation of the wood materials; and monitoring and managing forests and forest related activities (currently there are many forest exploitation licenses being given from various Central Government and District Council sources).
- viii. The District Councils should create a favorable environment for participation of private sector (or private-public partnerships) to invest in the development of high performance, responsive, and efficient crop, livestock and natural resources products' value and supply chains. This would, for example, minimize post harvest losses of bumper crop and horticultural produce harvests, e.g. in the 2013/2014 season in Western Tanzania and Southern Highlands (e.g. maize, cabbage, Irish potatoes, pears, oranges, avocado, and milk). Simple handling and pest proofing methods like the Cocoon, efficient supply chains, and well thought ex ante marketing could have prevented losses and financial disasters. People are encouraged to increase production and when they respond and produce large volumes it turns into harvest disasters (*majanga ya mavuno*). These results in frustration regression and people are hesitant to increase volumes next time, and resort to subsistence/low volume production as a form of risk management. This may be undertaken not only in PEI but also in the development and execution of other local and national initiatives such the Big Result Now (BRN) initiatives; and
- ix. Promote sustainable firewood and charcoal production using fast growing trees and woodlands, promotion and facilitation of small- to large-holder firewood tree growing initiatives, and promotion of clan and family based forest plantations such as *Ngitiri* in Sengerema District. Deliberate efforts and special attention should be directed to availing access to high yielding quality seeds (fitting local climate and specificities), startup capital, price information, prevention of fires, and access to technical knowledge in silviculture and other woodlot management practices and forestry extension services at Ward and Village levels.

ENVIRONMENT AND CLIMATE CHANGE ISSUES

Key findings

This assessment found that environmental degradation (land degradation, deforestation, loss of biodiversity, and pollution of water sources) and unpredictable and unstable rainfall are having detrimental effects at family level and for implementation of PEG activities. This,

together with inability to devise and adopt innovative livelihood strategies, limited livelihood diversification, and inadequate adaptive and mitigation capacity and resilience by the stakeholders in the District are constraining generation of consistent outputs from PEG interventions and are undermining social economic development efforts in some areas.

From the observations made by the authors, the Districts and communities will have to prepare and devise strategies for the following events (Bamwenda G.R. 2008, 2012, and 2013):

- i. Rise in average ambient temperature may result in increased spread of pests and diseases among livestock, wildlife and crops in all six Districts through climate sensitive vector and water borne diseases such as malaria, rift valley fever, dysentery, bilharzias, cholera and typhoid in areas where they were unknown. Other incidences of crop pests may increase over time and the pests may become more prevalent with time. As a result, emerging diseases such as batobato, banana xanthomonas wilt, panama, elihuka, coffee wilt, headsmuts, fusarium wilt, maize streak, cassava mosaic, cassava purple stripes, cassava root rot, and rust particularly in green grams may become more prevalent;
- ii. Changes in air and ocean currents for example La-Niña and El Niño events similar to those that were responsible for the severe droughts that occurred in most parts of Tanzania in 1996/1997 and 1997/1998 may threaten key drivers of social economic development due to declining levels of fresh water resources for human and animal consumption, agriculture and livestock development, minerals extraction, and small and medium processing industries' activities;
- iii. Rainfall variability and drought may cause abiotic and biotic stresses to become more frequent, widespread, and intense in all Districts, with exception of Ikungi District, which is located in the semi-arid area. This may result in shift of agro ecological zones and decline in crop productivity and production levels, and food and feed insecurity for people, livestock, and wildlife;
- iv. Decline in quantities and diversity of certain fish species in Bukoba Rural, Bunda, Sengerema, and Nyasa Districts;
- v. Fast growing population and livestock densities and long dry spells may result in rise in natural resource based conflicts amongst communities and between people and wildlife due to declining land, water and pastures;
- vi. Destruction of property, and human settlement and infrastructure, e.g. such as irrigation schemes, water storage, roads and bridges by floods;
- vii. Water shortage may affect wildlife and the tourism industry in Bunda and Bukoba Rural Districts;
- viii. Potential mass extinction of certain species in fragile certain ecosystems in all Districts; and
- ix. Potential increase in cotton production with rise in average air temperatures in Bunda and Sengerema Districts.

Recommendations

The District Council and national and local environmental stakeholders should develop measures and solutions to the following key challenges that are eroding gains made by PEG-CC interventions: Insufficient awareness and knowledge on environmental and other policies and laws (e.g. on land and water resources); the pace of addressing land degradation not matching the degradation rate due partly to unsustainable farming and mining, wetland degradation, overgrazing, tree and bush clearing and wild fires; and insufficient financial resources to support environmental interventions. Others include: low public awareness and inadequate institutional, financial, and human resources to address climate change issues; rapid population growth and proliferation of unplanned settlements; and insufficient development of alternative sources of energy and building materials promoting continued deforestation.

Key actions

Specific actions

- i. Promote and strengthen traditional and modern early warning rainfall systems and indigenous climate resilient agricultural systems;
- ii. Undertake a comprehensive vulnerability assessment on climate change impacts in the District;
- iii. Enhance Councilors' and technical cadres' awareness and understanding on climate change vulnerabilities and potential impacts in the District;
- iv. The District Councils, private sector, NGOs, FBOs, and other development partners should strategize and promote diversification of local economies to reduce overdependence on climate-sensitive sectors (agriculture, livestock, forestry) and promote alternative livelihoods systems, e.g. fabrication of coal briquettes for household, brick making, and industrial purposes in Ileje District;
- v. Increase resilience to rainfall variability and drought by adopting fast growing and abiotic and biotic stress tolerant crop, livestock, and tree varieties;
- vi. Incorporate agro-forestry as an important practice in conserving soil moisture, weed control and improving soil fertility;
- vii. Motivate communal and individual afforestation by establishing nurseries through individual growers and by groups, e.g. schools and other institutions, as a source of income and tree planting as an income generating and asset accumulation venture;

- viii. Support climate change adaptation: The District Council and Central government, private sector and other stakeholders should establish a sustainable cooperative framework and support climate change adaptation through efficient technology, advice on changing cropping patterns and cultivation of climate resilient crops, building new water projects for water harvesting, flood control and drought management, and investing in sustainable non-farm activities, including processing; mining; aquaculture; apiary industry (beekeeping products for food, cosmetics, pharmaceuticals, and industrial products; and trade); Increase farmers, livestock, and fishers awareness on the full impacts of adverse and positive climate change effects on their future activities and how to augment and upscale their indigenous and modern knowhow, practices and technologies to enhance resilience, reduce suffering, and strengthen mitigation and adaptation capabilities;
- ix. Improve the gross margins from cultivation of cassava, maize, paddy, sorghum, millet and cotton, through a comprehensive approach, i.e. encouraging farmers to use both improved variety seeds such as disease resistant cassava varieties, and hybrid and climate resilient maize, upland rice, high yielding sorghum, and fertilizer as a package;
- x. Provide greater security for producers through introduction of instruments such as climate insurance;
- xi. Promote management of cross-border natural resource, e.g. in Bunda District between Serengeti Ward-Serengeti National park to minimize conflict as result of stress on water and pasture for pastoral communities;
- xii. The government, private sector and other stakeholders should support climate change adaptation through efficient technology, changing cropping patterns, building new water projects for flood control and drought management, and investing in sustainable non-farm activities. Empower, motivate and provide resources to research institutions to produce appropriate solutions to environmental and climate change challenges;
- xiii. The District council, Ministry of Natural Resources and Tourism (MNRT), Vice Presidents Office- Directorate of Environment (VPO), and Tanzania National Parks Authority (TANAPA) to address changes in biodiversity and ecosystems services i.e. ecological range shifts of specific wildlife species due to changing climatic conditions. This may lead reduced regeneration of pastures and water resources for the wild animals, and decreasing carrying capacity of the Serengeti National Park area in Bunda District; and
- xiv. To improve the regulatory synergies in the environmental protection and conservation areas of PEG-CC activities, strengthen coordination between the VPO, NEMC and other ministries and agencies by: a) improving the information and resources flow functions in the National Environmental Policy that is currently being revised (Mwalyosi R., 2014); b) in the assessment, validation, and stakeholder reporting of the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA), Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA), and other instruments such as economic instruments (market-based approaches for environmental protection, command and control and voluntary measures), environmental standards and indicators,

and guiding principles (precautionary principles, polluter-pays principle, strict liability, etc.).

GENDER ISSUES

Key findings

In most Districts, with exception of Ileje District, the interviewees did not report any serious gender challenges. But from other works of the authors and literature review indicate that there are some gender concerns and incidents that need to be addressed, as presented below.

In the case of spousal violence, the Mara region, where Bunda District belongs, has the highest prevalence of Gender Based Violence cases among the studied Districts (GBV, i.e., emotional, physical, and sexual abuse/violence): 66.4 per cent of women ages 15-49 have experienced physical violence since age 15, and 32.5 per cent have experienced sexual violence. In the case of other Regions were the studied Districts belong, the GBV levels are: Kagera (Bukoba Rural, 47%), Mwanza (Sengerema, 42%), Mbeya (Ileje, 46%), Ruvuma (Nyasa, 36%), Singida (Ikungi, 46%). At national level, the levels are emotional violence (36%), physical violence (39%), and sexual violence (17%) (THDS 2010; 3rd Women Leaders Conference on Gender-Based Violence, held 4–6 April 2013 in Mara, Tanzania).

FGM is most prevalent in the Northern (Bunda District) and Central zones (Ikungi District) of Tanzania (28 TOOMANY, Country Profile: FGM in Tanzania, December 2013). According to some reports, FGM is more widely practiced in approximately seven of the regions of mainland Tanzania (Mella, 2002; Ali and Strøm, 2012). According to the DHS, 2010 the percentages of cut women from the Manyara, Dodoma, Arusha, Singida, Mara and Kilimanjaro regions with range between 20-70%. Women in these areas are more likely to already have at least one circumcised daughters and would also consider having other daughter circumcised (DHS, 2010). Mara has one of the highest prevalence of female genital mutilation (FGM) in Tanzania, a traditional practice often celebrated as a rite of passage to womanhood. About forty per cent of women ages 15–19 in Mara undergo FGM, which involves cutting in the genital area and can have serious health consequences, including hemorrhaging, infection, and complications during childbirth, and even death. According to the Christian Council of Tanzania baseline studies, the prevalence of FGM in Serengeti Ward, Bunda District, estimated by survey respondents, is 75% (Waritay and Wilson, 2012). In the case of other Regions were the studied Districts belong, the FGM levels are: Kagera (Bukoba Rural, 0%), Mwanza (Sengerema, 1%), Mbeya (Ileje, 0.5%), Ruvuma (Nyasa, 1.4%), Singida (Ikungi, 43%) (28 TOOMANY, Country Profile: FGM in Tanzania, December 2013). At national level overall prevalence of FGM in girls/women aged 15-49 years was 14.6% between 2004 and 2010 (DHS), and at a younger age - with those cut before age one year increasing from 28.4% to 31.7%. (Country Profile, FGM in Tanzania, 2010;

National Bureau of Statistics (NBS); Tanzania Demographic and Health Survey 2010.” Dar es Salaam, Tanzania: NBS and ICF Macro).

From private discussions between the authors and some people from the Districts, it emerged that factors contributing to gender based violence and driving the continuance of the FGM practice in the studied Districts are:

- The research conducted in Mihingo and Hunyari wards in Bunda district, found that in recent years FGM incidents among many tribes in Bunda is on the increase for the simple reason of fetching a hefty bride price from the Kuryas. Kurya men are ready to offer a bride price from 10 cattle upward but they would not give even one for a girl who has not undergone the genital mutilation (Gender Based Violence (TAMWA, 2013);
- Lack of basic education is a root cause for perpetuating social stigmas surrounding GBV and FGM;
- GBV acts are considered normal- men beating their spouses and vice versa is a non-issue, and are rarely reported. The village leader in Serengeti Ward informed the authors that it would be a great shame (*aibu*) for a man to report that the wife has beaten him (after a good drink or quarrel), so he suffers quietly; and
- Life frustrations (hardships of life, whereby they cannot make ends meet) and heavy drinking/alcoholism.
- Feeling in the family that their daughters cannot succeed without FGM (qualify to be married and the family getting the requisite cows) and as a result campaign against FGM is turning stealthy and the whole thing is done in secrecy;
- Lack of respect from their wives, and denying their husbands their basic rights (*haki ya ndoa*) to the extent that the men decide to be violent or abandon them. In some cases women abandon husbands when the husband seeks outside alternatives (*nyumba ndogo, kukosa nakshi ya mahaba*);
- A wife being beaten by her man is sometimes perceived by some women as an act of love and jealous “*wivu*”. Traditionally, in Mara region, women say that a man who beats his wife shows true love;
- Girls feel societal pressure to undergo FGM in order to benefit from status, celebration and transition to adulthood as the male youths experience in the circumcision ceremonies;

In view of the above, there is a need for a combined approach to empower women and girls to escape these and other gender challenges and to develop and encourage other approaches to reverse the GBV and FGM trends in Bunda District.

Recommendations

The District Council, Civil society, and gender stakeholders should strengthen gender mainstreaming efforts, including gender specific and transformative actions that will ensure equitable share, equal access and control over resources, privileges, benefits, and opportunities.

Key actions

Specific actions

- i. To reduce the workload on women, the District council, private sector, NGOs, and development partners should promote and facilitate the proliferation and use of low cost eco-stoves and biogas systems for cooking and lighting, and transportation of water using motorized or cattle based carts.
- ii. Sustainable changes in knowledge, attitude and practice may directly impact FGM and GBV being abandoned: The District Council to develop action plans and allocate resources to support women's rights and self-sustainability, including further empowering women and girls by improving education opportunities for girls and sensitizing communities on the effects of harmful traditional practices such as FGM. In addition, such programs should equip women with knowledge of their rights and legal assistance;
- iii. The District council and gender stakeholders should design and conduct anti-FGM education programs that focus on educating women, men, girls, and boys and the wider community on GBV and FGM. This will enable them to have a realistic picture of the situation which may ultimately lead to the amendment of the relevant traditions, local by-laws and policies.
- iv. The Civil society and District Council should gather a collective voice to change harmful traditions through conducting awareness raising to traditional and political leaders to understand and join forces against gender based violence practices. This may enable communities to speak out in shaping their response to ending FGM.
- v. The Ministry of Community Development, Gender and Children, Public leaders, Faith Based Organizations, and Community Based Organizations should encourage tribal/traditional community leaders to develop and promote alternative rites of passage so as to initiate momentum for change;
- vi. The District Council should train health providers to be better positioned to manage complications surrounding FGM. In addition, there is a need to improve access to healthcare through e.g. establishing an FGM complications referral program to ensure women are receiving appropriate care quickly in the Districts' public and private hospitals and health care centers;
- vii. The District Council and NGOs should from time to time conduct research to get up-to-date data on the prevalence and change in FGM that includes infants and girls under 15 years old, so as to capture recent trends and to discern the psychological consequences of

- FGM. Given the strong link between FGM and ethnicity, there is also a need to collect data along ethnic lines;
- viii. The authors are proposing that the District Council should encourage FGM to be carried in hospitals to protect the women/girls from the health risks posed by traditional circumcision, and to remove the practice from the community and therefore slowly to break the strong cultural link between FGM and other cultural practices.
 - ix. Empower women to be financially independent to safeguard their rights and improve their lives to enable them to fulfill their potential by: i) Increasing opportunities for entrepreneurship training to build agro-entrepreneurial ability and self-employment and diverse market participation to supply local and distant markets; ii) giving women access to know-how, techniques and technologies for increasing crop production (grains, horticultural products, cassava, millet and pulses) and to ensure that higher rates of crop yield growth are sustained in the face of climate change impacts, worsening water scarcity, and rising fertilizer prices; iii) increasing resilience to rainfall variability and drought by stressing nutritious and tolerant crop varieties to minimize losses and suffering, e.g. malnutrition of their children; and iv) since women potentially hold the greatest leverage for agricultural development, train them in enterprise and group/association development;
 - x. The District council should give priority to qualified women groups in the allocation of works in the District Councils, as a form of affirmative action;
 - xi. Conduct a study/business health check to assess the results chain of poverty-environment-gender activities on the performance and development of women and youth entrepreneurial groups/enterprises in the District; and
 - xii. The District councils should conduct a study to assess vulnerability, impacts and risks of climate change on women, children, youth and elderly.

Other recommendations

- i. Conduct a study to review the Poverty Environment Initiative (Global) and PEI Africa, analyze generated opportunities, barriers, and success stories from other countries, and identify experiences and lessons that could be customized, adapted, and be used to augment the performance of PEI Tanzania processes, sustainability of achievements, and ensuring progress to long term impacts after the project ends in 2017.
- ii. The District Council, Ministry Health and Social Services and TACAIDS should provide information to households and health care providers on a continuous basis on the sources/causes, prevention practices, management of risks (e.g. addressing the intersections between gender-based violence or coercive behavior and spread of viral related diseases, i.e. sexually transmitted infections, HIV seropositivity, etc.), testing options, treatment, and options for reducing/stemming the spread of communicable

diseases, specifically hepatitis B and C, HIV/AIDS, and Ebola. This may include indentifying indigenous practices attitudes and behaviors that may reinforce HIV prevention and treatment (e.g. *kupanga* practice in Nyasa District). Recognizing and ensuring that the spread of these important diseases are addressed, could make the difference between the long-term success, failure, and sustainability of Poverty-Environment efforts in the District.

- iii. From time to time conduct an evaluation to assess the project's results chains including change in attitude and behavior, value generated, lessons learned, impacts, and knowledge gained from PEI capacity building activities in the District Council and in the communities.

Appreciation

The Assessment Team wishes to express its sincere appreciation for the considerable support, advice and assistance provided by all those concerned – the Council, leadership and management team, and other PEI stakeholders in Bunda, Ikungi, Ileje, Nyasa, Sengerema, Nyasa and Bukoba Rural Districts, UNDP and UNEP staff, GoT staff, management and staff of ESRF, as well as all those other stakeholders in the PEG-CC sector who have given so generously of their time and experience. The Team has received a wide diversity of views but all given with a view to the future successful development of the Districts.

In addition, there is considerable appreciation for the UNDP/UNEP support to date in funding this study. It is now important that support continues through to address issues that emerged from this report in order that the beneficial effects of the investments made so far are scaled up to benefit the wider stakeholders in the Districts and in Tanzania.

This report was prepared by Gratian R. Bamwenda, Hamza Mkai, Margreth Nzuki, and Abdallah. K. Hassan.

REFERENCES

- Bamwenda G.R. 2008. The impact of global warming on Tanzania's food security. MBA Thesis, Eastern and Southern Africa Management Institute-Maastricht School of Management. February.
- Bamwenda G.R. 2012. Policy prescriptions for potential future droughts and food insecurity in Tanzania, PACN Congress on Agricultural Productivity, Water and Waste, United Nations Conference Centre, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, 26 - 27 November 2012.
- Bamwenda G.R., Mashindano O., and Hangi M. (2013). Promoting Agriculture-Climate Change-Trade Linkages for Development in the East African Community, PACT International.
- DHS, 2010: Tanzania Demographic Health Survey, National Bureau of Statistics, Dar es Salaam, Tanzania and ICF Macro, Calverton, Maryland, USA: <http://www.measuredhs.com/publications/publication-fr243-dhs-final-reports.cfm>.

Children's Dignity Forum/FORWARD, 2010: Voices of Child Brides and Child Mothers in Tanzania, Peer Research Report on Child Marriage in Tarime District, Mara Region, Tanzania: www.forwarduk.org.uk/download/194

Ngowi, 2011: A Culture of Circumcision in the Kurya Tribe of Tanzania: <http://blog.compassion.com/circumcision-in-africa-a-culture-of-circumcision-in-the-kurya-tribe-of-tanzania>.

Mwalyosi R., Bamwenda G.R., Chacha N., Kihinzi, P., Kazi V. 2014. Draft Revised National Environmental Policy, 2014, VPO.

Pearson W. et. al. 2014. Advancing Women in Science. An international Perspective, Springer.

National Bureau of Statistics. (2012). National Census Statistical Book – 2012; 2011/12 Household Budget Survey (HBS)

Nzuki M., Bamwenda G.R., Mashindano, O., Hassan K. A., Mkai H., and Kizoka L.R., (2014). Bukoba Rural, Bunda, Ileje, Ikungi, Nyasa and Sengerema Districts' Survey. Tanzania Media Women's Association (TAMWA), November/December, 2013.

TDHS (2010). Gender-Based Violence and Female Genital Cutting; Tanzania Media Women's Association, TAMWA. (2013). Gender Based Violence Research Report.

The World Bank (2014). Tanzania Economic Update.

United Republic of Tanzania 1999. Tanzania Development Vision 2025. Planning Commission, Dar Es Salaam.

United Republic of Tanzania 2001. Agricultural Sector Development Strategy. October 2001.

United Republic of Tanzania 2003. Agricultural Sector Development Programme. Framework and Process Document, March 2003.

United Republic of Tanzania (2013). Post-2015 National Priorities.

United Republic of Tanzania 2011. The Tanzania Five Year Development Plan (2011/12-2015/16).

United Republic of Tanzania 2010. National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty Phase II (MKUKUTA II).

Waritay and Wilson, 2012: 'Working to end Female Genital Mutilation and Cutting in Tanzania – the Role and Response of the Church', commissioned by Tearfund.
